

-
- Present:
Trustees: Chair Jane Bryce, Vice-Chair Scott McKinlay, Randy Campbell, Ruth Ann Dodman, Dave Douglas, Jack Fletcher, Elizabeth Hudie, Tom McGregor, Bob Murphy, Lareina Rising, Shannon Sasseville
- Student Trustee: Cole Anderson and Brittany McLaren
- Staff: Director of Education Jim Costello, Superintendent of Business Brian McKay, Superintendents of Education, Dave Doey, Mike Gilfoyle, Gary Girardi, Taf Lounsbury and Phil Warner
- Regrets: Superintendent of Education Joy Badder
- Recording Secretary: Trish Johnston, Executive Assistant and Communications Officer
- Call to Order: Chair Bryce called the meeting to order at 7:00 p.m.
- #2016-61
Approval of the Agenda
Apr/12/2016
Moved by Randy Campbell, seconded by Elizabeth Hudie,
"That the Agenda for the Regular Board Meeting Public Session of April 12, 2016 be approved."
CARRIED.
- Declaration of Conflict of Interest: No declarations of conflict of interest were issued.
- #2016-62
Approval of Minutes
Mar/29/2016
Moved by Ruth Ann Dodman, seconded Dave Douglas,
"That the Board approve the Minutes of the Regular Board Meeting of March 29, 2016."
CARRIED.
- Business Arising from the Minutes
Director Costello referred to page 6 of the March 29, 2016 Board Minutes which read *SCITS was inspected by the Ministry representatives in 2011 and SCSS was inspected by the Ministry in 2014*. Administration has confirmed that these dates are flipped. Administration called Sazan Bimo from VFA and confirmed that SCITS was inspected by the Ministry representatives on March 17, 2014 with the report filed on August 27, 2014 and SCSS was inspected by the Ministry on October 14, 2011 with the report filed in March 2012. The Minutes will be revised.
Director Costello referred to the Motion passed by Trustees at the March 29, 2016 Board Meeting to move the May 10, 2016 Board Meeting from Chatham to Sarnia. Administration was to research potential neutral locations in the Sarnia area to host the Meeting. Director Costello explained that Administration looked at five sites in Sarnia - Aamjiwnaang First Nation, Lambton College, Sarnia Library, Alexander Mackenzie Secondary School (AMSS) and Northern Collegiate Institute and Vocational School (NCIVS). He provided information on seating capacity, parking availability and associated costs. Administration is recommending AMSS in Sarnia. NCIVS could be affected by the proposed boundary change so it is not a neutral site. AMSS services students from every part of Lambton County.
Chair Bryce referred to the LKDSB Procedural By-laws Section 18 which permits Board Meetings to be held at local schools under the jurisdiction of the LKDSB.
- #2016-63
May 10 2016 Board Meeting to be held at AMSS
Moved by Jack Fletcher, seconded Ruth Ann Dodman,
"That the Board move the May 10, 2016 Board Meeting to Alexander Mackenzie Secondary School (AMSS)."
CARRIED.

#2016-64
Action of the Regular
Board Private Session be
the Action of the Board

Moved by Scott McKinlay, seconded by Jack Fletcher,

“That the Action of the Regular Board in Private Session be the Action of
the Board.”

CARRIED.

Delegations:

Chair Bryce referred to the LKDSB Procedural By-laws Section 3.14 regarding Delegations. A person or group giving four days written notice shall have ten minutes to address the Board. She stated that Superintendent Warner would be timing the delegations. She confirmed that both speakers are willing to entertain questions from Trustees following their delegation.

Mr Mele regarding the
Proposed Closing of
SCITS

Mr. Mele explained that the copy of his presentation that Trustees received was not his final draft. His final draft will be provided to Ms. Johnston on April 13, 2016 to share with Trustees. He shared that his wife, son and daughter were all SCITS alumni. He shared the research he did on the schools closed in Windsor that are similar to SCITS and the surrounding area. He shared some alternative solutions from the Lowe alumni that they felt could have been done to save the school. He commented on the assets of SCITS and the replacement costs that were provided to him by a senior executive of a top three construction company. He shared comments from the drama and music alumni from SCITS. He commented on the SCITS Alumni's participation in every international skirmish throughout the 20th Century and the ultimate sacrifices made. He encouraged Trustees to better understand the value of the asset that they are talking about and to look at SCITS in a more profitable light.

Jordan Fohkens City of
Sarnia representative to
present the City Of
Sarnia's "Community
Impact Assessment
Report"

Jordan Fohkens, Planner at the City of Sarnia, explained that they were present under the direction of Council to present the impact assessment to the school board to provide information to the school board trustees to make an informed decision that is in the best interests for the community as a whole. He explained what they looked at - site context, land use considerations, cultural heritage, redevelopment potential, 2020 Vision and Enrolment Projections, school accommodation options and shared information on each component. Jordan Fohkens concluded by advising that staff identified that either school closure would likely have impacts on adjacent areas. He advised that on balance, SCSS offers greater opportunities for redevelopment and would appear to have less of an impact on its surroundings. SCITS is located in a designated mixed use area adjacent to some of the most vulnerable commercial and residential areas in the City. SCITS has significant cultural heritage value and is better integrated with the surrounding community from land use, walkability, cultural vibrancy, and crime prevention perspectives. Shutting another important socio-cultural community facility in this area may result in both short and long term impacts on the viability of the surrounding community.

Trustee Sasseville asked for clarification on the sidewalks in the SCSS area as to how much of the travel paths do have sidewalks. Jordan Fohkens explained that in the older areas of the City there are sidewalks on both sides of the roads. He advised that subdivision built in the 1960s and 1980s were not built with sidewalks unless they were collective roads. He advised that areas west of SCSS do have sidewalks but east of the school do not. He confirmed that areas near the schools are a priority to the City to install sidewalks. He advised that sidewalks would likely be incorporated into a street resurfacing project.

Vice-Chair McKinlay questioned what students spend downtown on average in the stores. Jordan Fohkens confirmed that they did not have that data but concerns were raised. Vice-Chair McKinlay questioned what did the City of Sarnia staff anticipate would happen to the retail values of properties if SCSS were to close.

Jordan Fohkens advised that he was not fit to provide information on that. He stated that the SCITS site is half the size of the SCSS site and based on similar size lots in the area and the need to put in a road in the area, it appears that it would be a loss to develop the SCITS area. In response to Vice-Chair McKinlay's question about how many City Councilors were present, none were identified.

Questions from the Public

Chair Bryce referred to the LKDSB Procedural By-laws Section 3.16 and 3:17, In addition to the foregoing, persons or groups may pose questions to the Board in accordance with the following procedure:

- a) the questioner shall submit the question either orally or in writing to the Chair of the Board;
- b) the Chair or his/her designate shall answer the questions if the information is immediately available or send a written reply following the meeting; and
- c) the questioner may ask a follow-up question for clarification. The Board may limit the number of questioners as it sees fit.

Chair Bryce requested that the individuals state their name and provide their email address so an answer could be provided if a follow-up reply was needed.

Susan Mackenzie stated that the Final Staff Report mentioned capital funding of \$14M for SCSS but there was no mention of funding for an auditorium. Superintendent McKay confirmed that the auditorium was still part of the plan but the report just referred to the grant application in total.

Gavin Hall former teacher at SCITS stated that he understood that the money for the auditorium was not part of the initial grant. He questioned if there was a separate grant for the auditorium. Superintendent McKay confirmed that the \$14M grant application would include all the work to be done if the Board were to pass a Motion to consolidate the schools. There is not a separate grant for the auditorium. In response to Gavin Hall's question about the auditorium size, Superintendent McKay explained that the architect would be tasked with providing options for the size of the auditorium. The size would be dependent upon what pricing option could be provided for the auditorium and the other required enhancements for the school.

Jane Merchant questioned if all of the \$14M grant would be spent at SCSS. Superintendent McKay confirmed that the grant would be spent at whatever school the consolidation occurs at. The Board must spend all the money at the school identified in the Ministry grant application.

#2016-65
Tender Report Heating
Upgrade – Phase 3,
NCIVS Report B-16-37

Superintendent McKay reported on the tender opening for the heating upgrade, at Northern Collegiate Institute and Vocational School.

Moved by Dave Douglas, seconded by Tom McGregor,

“That the Board award the tender to the successful bidder Wellington Builders Inc.”

CARRIED.

#2016-66
Tender Report - HVAC
Upgrade & Roof
Replacement at Indian
Creek Road Public School,
and HVAC Upgrade &
Classroom Renovations at
Wheatley Area Public

Superintendent McKay reported on the tender opening for the HVAC upgrade and roof replacement at Indian Creek Road Public School and the HVAC upgrade and classroom renovations at Wheatley Area Public School.

Moved by Ruth Ann Dodman, seconded by Randy Campbell,

“That the Board award the tenders as outlined in Report B-16-38.”

Superintendent McKay confirmed that roof top units usually last between 15 to 20

School Report B-16-38	years depending on the size of it and what it is servicing in a school. In response to Trustee Murphy's question, Superintendent McKay explained that tenders for similar projects are generally bundled under one recommendation but presented individually.	CARRIED.
#2016-67 Tender Report - Chiller Replacement & Renovations at Cathcart Public School Report B-16-39	Superintendent McKay reported on the tender opening for a chiller replacement and four classroom refresh and washroom renovations at Cathcart Public School. Moved by Elizabeth Hudie, seconded by Scott McKinlay, "That the Board award the tender to the successful bidder Maaten Construction Ltd."	CARRIED.
#2016-68 Tender Report - Storage Building & Lead Abatement at Lambton Central Collegiate and Vocational Institute (LCCVI) Report B-16-40	Superintendent McKay reported on the tender opening for a storage building and lead abatement at Lambton Central Collegiate and Vocational Institute. Moved by Dave Douglas, seconded by Tom McGregor, "That the Board award the tender to the successful bidder WD Lester Construction Services Inc."	CARRIED.
Ontario Public School Boards' Association Update Special Education Advisory Committee (SEAC) Update Report B-16-41	Trustee Fletcher reported that there is a regional meeting in Windsor on April 15 and 16 and that Trustees Dodman and Fletcher will be attending. Trustee Fletcher reported on the SEAC Meeting held on March 24, 2016 via video-conference from the Board Offices. Two Resource Teachers from Tecumseh Public School provided SEAC members with a presentation on student transitions. They explained the importance of developing transition plans for students as it helps to ensure the student is successful in the next phase of their education. They spoke about Action Plans that are developed and cited some examples of ways they provide individualized support. Staff representatives from Mooretown-Courtright Public School provided SEAC members with information about their school wide initiative on zones of regulation for students to communicate their emotions. The staff explained that the colour zones of regulation help students regulate their actions to allow for increased self-control and problem-solving.. SEAC members continued their review of the Special Education Report Amendments. Some will be voted on at the next SEAC Meeting. A memo from the Ministry of Education regarding <i>Provincial and Demonstration Schools Consultation</i> was provided to SEAC members for their information and potential feedback through an online survey with regard to programs and services available for students who are: deaf or hard of hearing, blind or have low vision, deaf blind, or have learning disabilities. The survey was open for stakeholder input until April 8, 2016. Associations shared reports and other business shared best practices.	
Final Staff Report on the	Chair Bryce explained that after each recommendation Trustees would be provided	

Consolidation of St. Clair
Secondary School (SCSS)
and Sarnia Collegiate
Institute & Technical
School (SCITS) and the
Revision of the City of
Sarnia Secondary School
Boundaries
Report B-16-42

with an opportunity to ask questions about the recommendations. Director Costello advised that the report was posted on the LKDSB website and he encouraged everyone to read it. He advised that Administration's role is to present information on facts and data and make recommendations in the best interests of all students in the LKDSB and he stated that he believes Administration has done that. He advised that the report is 42 pages in length and is organized into three sections: A. Background Information (most of which has been presented before), B. Accommodation Process, which is not yet complete, and C. Recommendations and accompanying Rationale. Superintendent Girardi advised that the purpose of the report is to provide Trustees with a summary. The Report was written to reflect the discussions throughout the process. The material in the report is reflective of the Minutes/Records of Action from the ARC Meetings, the commentary from the public, the materials generated by the LKDSB, the Ministry of Education and those third parties who have completed further assessments for the LKDSB as Administration delved into questions and discussions from the public. Superintendent Girardi presented demographic information. He advised that as of October 31, 2015, the LKDSB has 22,078 Full Time Equivalent (FTE) students. The Ministry indicates that the LKDSB has 9,426 Ministry rated empty pupil spaces as of October 31, 2015. LKDSB current capacity utilization is 70.1%. LKDSB projection of continued enrolment decline and capacity utilization is 21,480 FTE in 2020 (68.2%); 20,929 FTE in 2025 (66.4%); 20,446 FTE in 2029 (64.9%). Ministry of Education-London Region (South Western Ontario) rate of enrolment decline is 0.64% from 2014/2015 to 2015/2016 (3 times the provincial decline rate of 0.17%). LKDSB rate of enrolment decline is 1.6% from 2014/2015 to 2015/2016 which is nine times that of the province. Since amalgamation the LKDSB has built two new schools, Sir John Moore Community School in Corunna (1999) and P.E. McGibbon Public School in Sarnia (2010), both feeder schools to SCITS.

Superintendent Girardi shared the population decline in the City of Sarnia and St. Clair Township. Enrolment data for SCSS and SCITS was shared. The downward trends match the population decline in the area. The school enrolment 10 year forecast shows a slower rate of decline.

In addition to the respective declines in the overall population in the catchment areas of SCSS and SCITS, the CLASS staff have analysed the population of students within proximity to either school. When examining the combined student populations living in the City of Sarnia with boundaries at Highway 402 in the north, Modeland Road to the east, the railway tracks to the south and the St. Clair River to the west, there is a current total student population of 629 students. Of those students, 529 students or 84% are within walking distances to SCSS and 359 students or 57% are within walking distance to SCITS. There are a larger percentage of students in closer proximity to the SCSS site and this trend is expected to continue over the next four years.

Superintendent Girardi shared that the City of Sarnia's official Planning Department data indicates that the areas of planned growth within the City are located north of Highway 402 in the Rapids Parkway Area and south of Highway 402, east of Modeland Road. He noted that the coterminous school boards have secondary schools in that area.

Superintendent McKay reviewed the financial factors impacting the LKDSB. The following grants are impacted:

- School Facility Operations and Renewal Grant – Top Up Funding
- Declining Enrolment Adjustment Grant
- Geographic Circumstances Grant
- School Foundation Grant

The Ministry is phasing in the changes to the grants generally over a three year period starting in 2015/16. Superintendent McKay reviewed how each of the grants

will be impacted by the changes. The estimated total funding loss for the 2015/2016 school year in the grant categories is \$2,008,458.

Superintendent Girardi reviewed the components of the Accommodation Review process:

- The establishment of an Accommodation Review Committee with selection of members done by the schools involved.
- Public Meetings
- Community and Municipal Government consultation
- Public Delegations to Board of Trustees
- Meetings with LKDSB Staff

He reviewed the mandate of the ARC and advised that Administration held an orientation session for the ARC members. There were two Working ARC Meetings and two guided tours of the secondary schools. In the two Working Meetings the ARC members looked at the benefits of a larger secondary school, alternative options to the recommendation presented in the Initial Staff Report, and a request for the LKDSB to further investigate a comparison of the two schools in regard to structure, health and safety and building codes, and asbestos. Professionals presented information at the second Working ARC Meeting. Superintendent Girardi thanked the ARC members for their work.

Superintendent Girardi reviewed the options considered by the ARC members:
Status quo – There was little support from ARC members for this option. This option would see each school remain and function as it presently does with populations well under capacity. It was recognized by the Committee that consolidation of schools would allow for a greater opportunity for course selection and co-curricular activities. The ARC members recognized the need for the Board to achieve efficiencies.

SCSS Grade 7-12 School and SCITS Grade 7-12 School – There was little support from ARC members for this option. This option would see Grade 7 and 8 students from feeder schools for the respective secondary school attend either high school in a Grade 7 to 12 model. Both schools would be Grade 7 to 12 schools. While this would create more utilization in the secondary schools, it would create less utilization in the feeder schools and result in more elementary school closures than projected in the Pupil Accommodation Report 2015/2016 in order to achieve needed efficiencies for the LKDSB. It also would not change the secondary program and/or timetable options for students in Grades 9 to 12.

Consolidation at SCITS/SCSS and Consolidate at Either Site not used for the Secondary School as an Elementary School at SCSS – Initially there was no support for this option; however, it was reintroduced by some ARC members who thought it had some viability. The ARC did not reach consensus on this option. This option would see elementary schools in the vicinity of the respective secondary school and their student population move to a Kindergarten to Grade 8 school at the former SCSS site or the former SCITS site. This option would include more potential elementary school closures than initially forecasted by the LKDSB in the vicinity of the newly created elementary school in order to achieve needed efficiencies. Some ARC members were opposed to closing community elementary schools in order to maintain both secondary school buildings.

Closure of Additional Sarnia Secondary School(s) and Application for Construction of a New Secondary School – There was little support for this option from ARC members. This option would see the closure of all four secondary schools within the City of Sarnia and the construction of a new secondary school of approximately 2500 students in a location to be purchased.

Consolidation at SCITS of SCITS and SCSS with the Creation of a Dual Track Elementary School at SCSS – Grade K to 8 French Immersion (FI) and Grade K to Grade 8 English Regular Program – There was little support from the ARC

members for this option. This option would see elementary FI Students from Errol Road, Cathcart, High Park moved to the SCSS site. It would also see English students K to Grade 8 from neighbouring schools moved to the same site. This option would leave many elementary schools in the City of Sarnia under capacity with a potential for closure to create needed efficiencies for the Board. In addition to this, the majority of FI students in the City of Sarnia live in the present catchment area for NCIVS.

Closure of SCSS and the Consolidation of the Students at SCITS – This item received support from the SCITS ARC members. This option would see the consolidation of both secondary schools at the SCITS site in September 2017.

Closure of SCITS and the Consolidation of the Students at SCSS – This was recommended in the Initial Staff Report. This item received support from the SCSS ARC members. This option would see the consolidation of both secondary schools at the SCSS site in September 2017.

Superintendent Girardi explained that the two ARC Public Meetings were opportunities for the public to provide input. He provided a summary of information shared at the meetings. He explained that in addition to holding public meetings, Administration has over 20 pages of questions answered from the public and questions submitted by the public at the Working ARC Meetings. Administration has attempted to be transparent and display information on the LKDSB website. It would be impossible to have every item from the meetings in the report so Administration created a representation of the themes delivered.

Superintendent Girardi outlined the community consultations that have taken place related to the Accommodation Review Process. In response to an invitation to the Community Partners meeting in October 2015, the County of Lambton made available the County of Lambton-2011 Projection Summary – By Age Cohorts Report. The LKDSB has corresponded with the County of Lambton to clarify their population projections for the City of Sarnia. The LKDSB invited the City of Sarnia to the Special Board Meeting on October 6, 2015 to present the LKDSB Capital Plan and to inform all municipal partners of the LKDSB's desire to form partnerships to use unfunded student spaces in our schools. The LKDSB also initiated a meeting following the release of the LKDSB Pupil Accommodation Report and Initial Staff Report in November 2015. Subsequently the City of Sarnia staff delivered an Economic Impact Study for the potential closure of SCITS and SCSS to Council on March 21, 2016. In their report they concluded that they recommended the closure of SCSS rather than SCITS. City of Sarnia staff presented an overview of the report to Trustees at the April 12, 2016 Board Meeting. There is a link to their report on the LKDSB website. The Aamjiwinaang First Nation has students from their First Nation attending both schools. The LKDSB sought input into their participation for the Accommodation Review Committee. In addition, this has been a topic of discussion at the Native Advisory Committee for the LKDSB. The Sarnia Heritage Society contacted the LKDSB to inform the Board of the potential designation of SCITS as a Heritage site. They requested and were accommodated with tours of both SCSS and SCITS. The Board has had ongoing correspondence and discussions with representatives.

Three delegations have been made to the Board of Trustees to date and more are expected at the April 26, 2016 Board Meeting. Information from the delegations may be incorporated into an addendum to be presented to Trustees at the May 10 Board Meeting. Superintendent Girardi outlined the process followed to obtain school staff input into the Accommodation Process.

Superintendent Girardi presented Recommendation #1 "That the Board approve the consolidation of St. Clair Secondary School (SCSS) and Sarnia Collegiate Institute and Technical School (SCITS) temporarily at the SCITS site effective

September 2016 and permanently at the SCSS site effective September 2017 and close the SCITS site as of July 1, 2017.”

He explained that a consolidated secondary school could offer:

- Increased opportunities for multiple sections of the same course allowing for more flexibility for student timetables in the school.
- Lower student percentage of scheduling conflicts – With a larger student population, a higher percentage of students will attain a conflict free timetable resulting in more students receiving the courses that they requested during the option selection process.
- An increased breadth of senior courses would be offered to students resulting in a greater likelihood that specialized courses can be offered every year and in each semester. Currently at SCITS and SCSS, some senior (compulsory) courses “run” with low numbers at the expense of not offering other courses.
- Larger student populations generate more staff (in numbers) which provides more expertise and diversity in terms of qualifications and experience. This lends itself to the possibility of increased course options and co-curricular opportunities, i.e. athletics, the arts and clubs. It also provides an increased opportunity for teacher collaboration in subject specific and grade disciplines. Staff would have a greater opportunity to fully teach in their areas of primary qualifications and/or expertise.
- The consolidated site would provide an increased number of opportunities to offer a greater breadth of Specialized Program pathways for students. The consolidated site would be able to provide an increased choice of Specialist High Skills Major (SHSM) for students, i.e. Arts and Culture, Construction, Horticulture and Landscaping, Transportation. Other SHSM pathway programs such as Health and Wellness could also be considered.

Superintendent McKay provided the financial analysis for the recommendation to consolidate SCITS and SCSS at the SCSS site. He provided information on the operating costs for the 2014/2015 school year for both schools as well as a three year average. He noted that the main cost difference between the schools is the hydro. He commented on the different services at SCITS and the heating and cooling system at SCITS. The operating cost total for SCITS, using a three year average, is \$186,834.41 more than the cost total at SCSS.

Superintendent McKay presented the transportation information provided by CLASS. The consolidation of SCITS into the SCSS site would have minimal financial impact on busing costs for students living within the consolidated boundary for the consolidated school. There is the potential for an increase in busing costs for grandfathered students. This additional busing cost would end at the completion of the designated grandfathering period.

He reported that the projected Community Use Revenue (2015/16) is a combination of actual data and projected data: September 1, 2015 to January 10, 2016 – actual data and January 11, 2016 to June 30, 2016 – projected data based on rental permits in the CLASS system. The total for SCITS is \$51,118 and the total for SCSS total is \$4,885. SCITS is projected to generate \$46,233 more revenue for 2015/16 school year for Community Use of Schools. SCITS revenue total includes the Priority Schools Initiative (PSI) grant of \$34,000. He explained that the Board receives a \$34,000 Priority Community Use of Schools (PSI) grant from the Ministry which is assigned to SCITS. If the funds are not spent, they must be returned to the Ministry. The PSI designation may be transferred from one school to another based on the criteria that the grant would serve students in a similar geographic and socioeconomic area. The PSI grant was previously applied to LKDSB schools is Forest. Administration is confident the PSI grant could be transferred to the consolidated site.

Superintendent McKay reviewed the capital improvements at the schools since

2003. He explained that the Facility Condition Index (FCI) – an industry standard which expresses the facility's total renewal cost as a percentage of replacement value. LKDSB uses capital cost data from the Ministry of Education provided database (Total Capital Planning Solution - TCPS) for long term capital planning. TCPS is also the source of the FCI data used in the Accommodation Review process. He reviewed the capital improvement dollars spent on each school since 2003 - \$5,899,692 has been spent at SCITS and \$2,229,098 has been spent at SCSS. He shared the five year FCI data but confirmed that Administration has 10 year data for planning purposes. He referred to Sazan Bimo's, the Ministry representative at VFA, presentation at the ARC Working Meeting #2. Sazan Bimo provided a presentation on how the data works in the data base. Every February the numbers roll forward in the system. He confirmed that 2015 to 2019 is the period Administration is looking at now. The numbers are the same numbers looked at in the fall just rolled forward. The summary of the total capital needs for the five years for SCITS is \$15,165,980 with a FCI of 51.34% and the total for SCSS is \$13,046,478 with a FCI of 39.66.

He commented on the financial analysis related to asbestos that was also presented at ARC Working Meeting #2. Asbestos management and remediation programs occur annually at LKDSB schools. He shared the total asbestos removal and repair costs for the past six years for both schools – SCITS \$121,302.40 and SCSS \$49382.35. The LKDSB asbestos consultants for SCITS and SCSS projected future asbestos remediation costs for both schools. The total asbestos removal and repairs costs for all items and issues at SCITS would be \$5,828,746 and SCSS would be \$790,094. He confirmed that all of the work would not be done at one time. Generally work is done as part of renovations or upgrades.

Superintendent McKay presented the information from the LKDSB architect consultants hired to assess the cost for undertaking all accessibility and building code compliance capital work for both schools. This information was presented at the ARC Working Meeting #2. The figures were provided by JP Thomson. The estimated total for SCITS is \$13,740,000 and the estimated total for SCSS is \$3,180,000.

Superintendent McKay advised that the structural capital summary was provided by Geoff Dale and is posted on the LKDSB website. The LKDSB Structural Engineering consultant Geoff Dale was hired to assess the cost for undertaking all structural capital work at both schools. Geoff Dale reported that there were \$1,287,000 structural review costs at SCITS and \$15,000 at SCSS. The large identified structural issues at SCITS included in the figure above are the South Wall of the pool structure with an estimated cost of \$1,000,000 to repair and the brick veneer at SCITS that is in poor condition with an estimated cost between \$175,000 to \$250,000 to repair.

The following table totals the capital costs for each school in the above discussed areas:

Capital Cost Category	Source	SCITS	SCSS
Ministry of Education Long Term Capital Costs (part of FCI Calculations)	Accruent Acquires, VFA, Inc. Capital Database	\$15,165,980	\$13,046,478
Asbestos Assessment Costs	EXP Services Inc. Golder Associates Ltd	5,828,746	790,094
Accessibility and Building Code Costs	JP Thomson Architects Ltd.	13,740,000	3,180,000
Structural Analysis Costs	Robert E. Dale Limited, Consulting Engineers	1,287,000	15,000
TOTAL:		\$36,021,726	\$17,031,572

Superintendent McKay advised that the LKDSB intends to apply for a \$14 million capital grant. One requirement in the application process is that there must be a Board of Trustee supported Accommodation Review decision in order to apply for capital funding. The grant application success is based on merits of the Board's capital submission as it compares to grant applications submitted by other Ontario school boards. The consolidation at the SCSS site, if successful, would be undertaken regardless of the success of any capital grant application. The capital focus would then be on the renewal and refurbishment of the existing SCSS site.

In response to Trustees Fletcher's question regarding the details of the capital expenditures at SCITS in 2003, Superintendent McKay confirmed that Administration would provide the details.

Trustee Fletcher read out his question and answer from the March 29, 2016 Board Meeting that confirmed the Board cannot submit a grant application until after May 10. He asked what might be included in the grant and questioned if the Trustees would receive those details before May 10. Superintendent McKay advised that Mark Beaulieu from JP Thomson advised that there are some requirements at both schools that need to be done to conform to code requirements before program needs can be addressed. For example, the dead end corridors need to be eliminated. An estimated \$13 M would need to be spent at SCITS to address the code compliance issues and approximately \$3,180,000 would need to be spent at SCSS to address the code compliance issues. This would result in very little of the \$14M grant being left to address other needs at SCITS and approximately \$11M left to address other needs at SCSS. Superintendent McKay mentioned that the HVAC system at SCSS was a priority and the auditorium. Administration has asked Architect Mark Beaulieu to create drawings for discussion by Trustees prior to making any decisions on size, etc. and options for a track as well.

In response to Trustee Rising's question about dead end corridors in a school built in a U, Superintendent McKay commented on the potential for new program areas. This was not in the initial discussion with the architect and would be dependent on the location of the corridor. It could result in major structural changes to solve the problem. He commented that the Fire Department has shared concerns about some areas at SCITS and representatives are working with the school principal to

ensure a properly executed fire plan for students.

Trustee Murphy questioned if all the forecasted student populations are numbers based on actual data or student choice modeling. Superintendent Girardi commented on feeder school data gathered regarding student choice. Baragar uses this data to produce trends over time.

In response to Trustee Hudie's question about enrolment Superintendent Girardi confirmed that the principals provided figures at the Working Meeting but Administration uses the Ministry grant date of October 31 for enrolment numbers. He acknowledged that the figures do fluctuate a bit.

In response to Trustee Hudie's question about asbestos abatement, Superintendent McKay confirmed that Administration is not going to do all the \$5M worth of work at SCITS at once. Regarding the \$1M needed for the repair of the pool wall at SCITS, Superintendent McKay confirmed that other options were discussed. The other options, like bracing the wall or shoring up the wall, would be cheaper but not cheap. Trustee Hudie suggested that the City partner with the Board on the use of the pool.

Vice-Chair McKinlay referred to the difference in the annual operating costs noting that hydro costs are a major piece. He questioned how much it cost to operate the pool at SCITS. Superintendent McKay explained that the utilities at the schools are not separately metered for the pool area. He advised that if this was information Trustees wished to know, Administration could have a consultant do a costing on the pool. Vice-Chair McKinlay noted that when the Ministry took over a school board they went in and closed all the pools as one of their first steps to reduce costs.

In response to Vice-Chair McKinlay's question about the impact of a higher FCI on the grant application, Superintendent McKay advised that he asked the question of the Ministry representatives when he met with them to run through the grant application process for both SCITS and SCSS. FCI numbers do feed into the grant application.

In response to Vice-Chair McKinlay's question about when the LKDSB would need to spend the \$5M on asbestos abatement at SCITS, Superintendent McKay referred to the comparison provided for both schools. It outlines the asbestos issues for both schools. The main issue at SCITS is the plaster on the walls and the delamination of the walls that is occurring. There are two methods to address it - remove it entirely, which is most costly, or encapsulate and seal it in. It is an ongoing issue at SCITS.

Trustee Rising advised that she would like to see what makes up the expense for electricity at the schools. Chair Bryce explained that Trustees would need to pass a Motion to have Administration produce the report. She encouraged Trustee Rising to make the Motion under New Business.

Trustee Sasseville referred to the \$5M worth of work needed to address the asbestos issues and asked if it was possible to get a sense of what needs to be done right away at both schools. Superintendent McKay explained that the needs are usually determined by the capital work being done in the school but there could be hidden costs as well. Administration could look into possibly producing a breakdown.

Trustee Sasseville stated that she was a swim mom and wondered if any conversations had taken place with the YMCA to accommodate students and the swim team if SCITS were to close. She wondered if there would be an increase in cost to accommodate them. Superintendent Girardi explained that most schools

have swim teams and operate using community facilities. The YMCA is very open to having schools use their facilities. He advised that the secondary school swim meets are held at the YMCA because of their facilities. He has not had any discussions with the YMCA representatives directly. Trustee Sasseville suggested that Administration reach out to the YMCA.

In response to Trustee Rising's question about the grandfathering of students Director Costello explained that traditionally the Board has grandfathered students to allow them to finish their secondary school experience at the school they began secondary school at.

In response to Trustee Fletcher's question, it was confirmed that details of a grant application would not be known prior to the May 10, 2016 Board Meeting.

Trustee Hudie expressed concern over the possible Historical Society designation for SCITS might have and the impact on the site. Superintendent McKay confirmed that no allowance was made for the impact of the historical designation and there is no data on what that would look like. Vice-Chair McKinlay asked Jordan Fohkens, Planner at the City of Sarnia, for his opinion. Jordan Fohkens clarified that the committee is called the Sarnia Heritage Committee and they typically designate certain features in schools as heritage features. At a school in Windsor it was the auditorium but he did not know the associated costs. Vice-Chair McKinlay questioned who had the authority to designate and determine what aspects could be heritage features. He would not want the Board and future Boards to lose control of the building. Jordan Fohkens explained that the City of Sarnia would have to pass a Bylaw on a recommendation of the Sarnia Heritage Committee. The decision could be appealed. Allan Shaw, Acting Director of Planning and Building for the City of Sarnia, explained that they could designate elements of a structure or the entire structure as a heritage site. He advised that it does not mean that the designated items cannot be changed but consultation with the historical engineer would have to take place and approval provided to ensure that the designated items remain true to the date and period of materials. He advised that this generally drives up the cost of the repairs especially if they are not readily available. It is similar to the building code and fire code requirements and there is very little the Board could do.

Superintendent Girardi reiterated his discussions with the representatives from the Sarnia Heritage Committee. They confirmed that they would advise Administration of the next steps in their process. They indicated that SCITS was on their list but not designated.

#2016-69
Board to Extend the
Meeting to Complete the
Agenda

Moved by Scott McKinlay, seconded by Bob Murphy,

"That the Board extend the Board Meeting until the Agenda has been completed."

CARRIED.

In response to Trustee Rising's question about who decides what year the FCI costs come about, Superintendent McKay explained that Ministry consultants compile the costs and the years that the costs apply based on life cycles. The Board does accrue costs. In response to Trustee Rising's question about why Fire Code needs are not included in the FCI, Superintendent McKay explained that the Ministry representatives look at the building systems and structures and life expectancy and condition of structures. They assess the structure as is and do not look at additions or changes just the upkeep of the structure.

Trustee Murphy referred to data in the report regarding combined student enrolment and school capacity and questioned how would the over capacity of the

students be accommodated at SCSS. Superintendent Girardi confirmed that Administration has had discussion on that topic and the possibility of having to place portables at the site as a short term solution. Trustee Murphy questioned if the parties Administration rely on for student count forecast are really accurate at future projections. Superintendent Girardi advised that the desire is to create a consolidated school that offers a breadth of program so fewer students would choose to attend alternative schools. Director Costello explained that the LKDSB uses Baragar and it is used across the country by hundreds of school boards. The software predicts student enrolment and historically they have been very accurate. The company provides data on birth rates with good success. Numbers are dynamic and may change.

In response to Trustee Rising question about what was needed to be done in the basement rooms at SCITS to bring them up to code, Superintendent McKay confirmed that the architect is concerned about being able to make the basement barrier free at SCITS.

Vice-Chair McKinlay stated that on October 6, 2015 the LKDSB held a Special Board Meeting to present the LKDSB Capital Plan, share information and investigate partnership opportunities to utilize space in schools with the municipal sector and business sector. Director Costello confirmed that the City of Sarnia was invited to the Meeting but representatives were not in attendance.

Trustee Sasseville commented that she read that mould was an issue in the pool area in the basement at SCITS and noted that it was not mentioned in the Final Staff Report. In response to Trustee Sasseville's question if it was a significant issue Superintendents Girardi and McKay confirmed that it was discussed at one of the ARC Working meetings and advised that they would locate the information.

Superintendent Girardi presented recommendation #2 "That the Board approve the revised boundaries for the consolidated St. Clair Secondary School (SCSS) Sarnia and Collegiate Institute & Technical School (SCITS) School and Northern Collegiate Institute & Vocational School (NCIVS) effective July 1, 2016 for implementation September 2016."

Superintendent Girardi explained that if the Trustees approve the consolidation of SCITS and SCSS, the consolidated SCITS and SCSS catchment areas will remain the same aside from the area north of Highway 402. The Point Edward area is currently in the SCITS catchment area. A portion of the Bright's Grove area and the Errol Village area are currently in the SCSS catchment area. The proposed boundaries reflect the natural/physical divide that Highway 402 provides. Areas of Bright's Grove, Point Edward and Errol Village have a significant number of students already attending NCIVS. In those areas, parents are choosing to enroll their children at NCIVS and this boundary change reflects choices being made by parents.

Superintendent Girardi confirmed that the \$20,000 cost for grandfathering existing students would decline year over year for the duration of the grandfathering depending on the student population. Student Trustee Anderson questioned if the proposed boundary changes were approved would they be strictly enforced or would students still be able to attend outside of their boundary school. Superintendent Girardi confirmed that students would still be able to attend the school of choice if there was room. Director Costello advised that all secondary schools are governed by the same open access rule. Unless the Board declared a school closed to transfer due to space, students can apply to attend an out of area secondary school and if there is room in the school and courses requested the Principal will admit them. They would have to provide their own transportation. In response to Trustee Murphy's question about whether the figures reflect changes

post boundary change, Superintendent Girardi confirmed that they do based on feeder school data. He commented that half of the students living in Point Edward area chose to attend NCIVS last year.

Superintendent Girardi presented Recommendation #3 “That the Board approve “grandfathering” with transportation from September 2016 to June 2020, for students currently in Grades 8 to 12 affected by the boundary changes as outlined in the Proposed Boundary Package, effective July 1, 2016 for implementation in September 2016. No special conditions will be applied for siblings to attend the same school.”

He noted that students living in the new proposed catchment area for NCIVS, who are currently in Grade 9 to 12 and attending SCITS or SCSS, or Grade 8 students in this area who choose to attend the consolidated site in September 2016, would be grandfathered to the consolidated secondary school for a four year period to allow them to graduate. They would also have the option of attending NCIVS in September 2016. The additional costs for the grandfathering period of the consolidated secondary school students will be minor and are estimated at approximately \$20,000 annually. The additional costs will be comprised of additional kilometrage as buses are re-routed to accommodate the new mix of students. Currently, there are buses transporting students from the SCSS and SCITS areas north of Highway 402. These existing bus routes will continue to accommodate the grandfathered students. Administration is not recommending that grandfathering be provided to siblings to attend the same school due to additional unknown costs.

In response to Trustee McGregor’s question about past practice of grandfathering students, Director Costello confirmed that this approach is consistent with past LKDSB decisions.

Superintendent Girardi explained that Recommendation #4 “That the Board dissolve the Sarnia South Secondary Schools Accommodation Review Committee” was just a formality in the Accommodation Process.

Superintendent Girardi presented Recommendation #5 “That the Board approve the establishment of an Ad Hoc Committee to recommend to the Board a name for the consolidated St. Clair Secondary School and Sarnia Collegiate Institute & Technical School and appoint two Trustees to serve on the Committee.”

He explained that the practice of the Board has been to establish a Naming Committee when schools are consolidated. In accordance with Board Regulations R-AD-105, when schools are consolidated into one school, the renaming of Board facilities will be followed. This requires the Director of Education to establish an ad hoc committee to recommend a name to the Board for approval. He outlined the membership of the Naming Committee: The Committee is to be comprised of:

- (a) two trustees, appointed by the Board (one to chair the committee),
- (b) one facility administrator (principal or principal designate if applicable),
- (c) two representatives of the School Advisory Councils (if applicable),
- (d) two community representatives,
- (e) one member of the senior administration.

Superintendent Girardi explained that if the Board approves the consolidation of the Secondary Schools, a Transition Committee would be struck to address the transition of students and staff. Transition Committee membership consists of Superintendent(s) of Education or designate(s), CUPE, ETFO and OSSTF

President/Vice President and from each school Involved - principal, two teachers, School Council Chair, clerical/custodial staff, parent/community member, First Nation Partner, educational assistant and two students. Subcommittees are developed as needed and may have members that are separate from the Transition Committee members. The Transition Committee would be responsible for such things as school orientation/transition, memorabilia, resources and equipment, special events (including graduation and awards) extra-curricular activities.

Superintendent Girardi stated that the Accommodation Review process is still underway, with opportunities for public delegations at the April 26, 2016 Board Meeting. Any changes to the Final Staff Report as a result of public delegations, will be included in the Final Staff Report to be presented to Trustees for approval at the May 10, 2016 Board Meeting. The May 10 Regular Board Meeting will be held in Sarnia.

In response to Trustee Rising's question about membership on the Transition Committee and Naming Committee and how input from the public is obtained, Director Costello reviewed the Naming Committee members. He explained that the LKDSB has had success with Transition Committees in the past. Administration conducted follow-up surveys with students and staff and the results were overwhelming positive. Members on the Transition Committee and Sub-Committees took ownership of determining such things as what to do with the memorabilia, student awards, new mascot etc. The Sub-committees report on their activities to the Transition Committee.

Vice-Chair McKinlay commented that the Naming Committee in Ridgeway solicited suggestions from the community-at-large based on criteria established by the Naming Committee. All the names were reviewed by the committee based on the criteria and a recommendation developed to present to the Board for approval.

Director Costello thanked Superintendents McKay and Girardi, Planning and Reporting Officer Vandeschoot and Executive Assistant Johnston for their contributions. He thanked ARC members for their time and efforts towards this difficult task and noted their passion. He commented on their desire for more drill down information which helped the process become more transparent and forced Administration to look deep into LKDSB data. Director Costello stated that the Report is fair, honest and based on facts. It contains the best recommendations for the long term health of the LKDSB. He stated that the costs are significantly higher to maintain SCITS over the long run. He commented that schools are built for students; not for adults. He encouraged Trustees to keep in mind the program needs and timetable course offerings; the cost of maintaining SCITS will allocate resources inefficiently and at the expense of all schools. He stated that Accommodation Reviews are not just about the schools which are named for consolidation. He advised that despite much of the negative energy associated with the process and public meetings, he was proud when he listened to students from both schools speak with pride about their schools and the programs offered within them. This speaks to the quality of our staff in both buildings. He believes that a consolidated school can be an even better school complete with a rich legacy of two great schools in a newer and hopefully renovated facility.

Chair Bryce thanked the ARC members for their work. The LKDSB greatly appreciates that the ARC members stepped forward to do this hard job. She applauded their dedication to the LKDSB and public education.

- Correspondence Chair Bryce shared that she received a letter from the Ontario Public Supervisory Officers' Association (OPSOA) inviting her, as Chair of the LKDSB, to the OPSOA President's Reception on April 14 in Toronto. As President of OPSOA, Superintendent Badder will be honored at the Reception. Chair Bryce will be presented with a scholarship to be awarded to a LKDSB student chosen by Superintendent Badder. On behalf of the LKDSB, Chair Bryce will say a few words about Superintendent Badder's contributions to the LKDSB. She noted that many lives have been enhanced because of Superintendent Badder.
- New Business
#2016-70
Administration to Prepare Hydro Report
- Moved by Lareina Rising, seconded by Shannon Sasseville,
"That Administration prepare a Board Report on the break down of hydro costs at SCITS and SCSS and provide a general idea of what components cause the big difference between SCSS and SCITS, not an engineering report."
CARRIED.
- #2016-71
Administration to Prepare Asbestos Report
- Moved by Shannon Sasseville, seconded by Lareina Rising,
"That Administration prepare a Board Report outlining what asbestos remediation and abatement would be considered immediate/urgent and what would be routine to be accomplished over time at both SCSS and SCITS and what are the anticipated short term costs for the next 1 to 3 years."
CARRIED.
- #2016-72
Administration to Prepare Heritage Report
- Moved by Scott McKinlay seconded by Ruth Ann Dodman,
"That Administration prepare a Board Report on the aspects of the declaration of a heritage building and potential impact on the Board's future decisions regarding changes in the structure of a building."
CARRIED.
- Trustee Hudie commented that she was proud of the staff and students at SCITS and SCSS who were taking positive steps to overcome the negativity associated with the ARC. They want to move forward. The students have acknowledged that they would like to maintain their own schools but want to just get along. They have demonstrated this desire with their creative solutions. Chair Bryce confirmed that all Trustees share that sentiment.
- Announcements The April 26 2016 Regular Board Meeting will be held at the Sarnia Education Centre, 7:00 p.m.
- Adjournment 10:40 p.m. There being no further business, Chair Bryce declared the meeting adjourned at 10:40 p.m.

Chair of the Board

Director of Education and Secretary of the Board