

**REGULAR BOARD, PUBLIC SESSION  
REPORT TO BOARD**

**FROM: Jim Costello, Director of Education**

**DATE: May 10, 2016**

**SUBJECT: Addendum to the Final Staff Report on the Consolidation of St. Clair Secondary School (SCSS) and Sarnia Collegiate Institute and Technical School (SCITS) and The Revision of the City of Sarnia Secondary School Boundaries**

The LKDSB Pupil Accommodation Report 2015/2016 and Initial Staff Report on the Consolidation of St. Clair Secondary School (SCSS) and Sarnia Collegiate Institute & Technical School (SCITS) were presented to the Board in compliance with LKDSB Regulation *Pupil Accommodation* No: R-AD-106 on November 24, 2015.

On April 12, 2016, Trustees received the Final Staff Report on the Consolidation of St. Clair Secondary School (SCSS) and Sarnia Collegiate Institute and Technical School (SCITS) and The Revision of the City of Sarnia Secondary School Boundaries. This Addendum to the Final Staff Report on the Consolidation of St. Clair Secondary School (SCSS) and Sarnia Collegiate Institute and Technical School (SCITS) and The Revision of the City of Sarnia Secondary School Boundaries provides Trustees with a final summary of the community consultation process and presents final recommendations for Trustees' decisions. The Final Staff Report, as presented on April 12, 2016, is included.

**Delegations to the Board**

Date	Sarnia South Secondary Accommodation Review Public Delegations	Synopsis
February 9, 2016	Regular Board Meeting	Keith Wyville spoke about the proposed closing of Sarnia Collegiate Institute & Technical School (SCITS). He asked Trustees to consider a series of questions in respect to the current proposal for SCITS.
April 12, 2016	Regular Board Meeting	Louie Mele spoke about the proposed closure of Sarnia Collegiate Institute & Technical School (SCITS). He shared research he had done on the schools closed in Windsor that are similar to SCITS, commented on the assets of SCITS and the replacement costs that were provided to him by a senior executive of a top three construction company. He encouraged Trustees to better understand the value of the asset that they are talking about and to look at SCITS in a more profitable light.
April 12, 2016	Regular Board Meeting	Jordan Fohkens, Planner at the City of Sarnia, under the direction of Council, presented the City of Sarnia's "Community Impact Assessment Report to the Board to provide information to the school board trustees to make an informed decision that is in the best interests for the community as a whole.
April 26, 2016	Regular Board Meeting	Wayne Wager, Sarnia Heritage Committee (SHC), spoke about the SHC's position statement regarding the conservation and protection of Sarnia Collegiate Institute and Technical School. Sarnia Heritage Committee identified SCITS as a building worthy of heritage status. The SHC are in the process of doing a more comprehensive study. There may be cost increases for maintenance should a designation be established in areas where the heritage designation is attached. The heritage designation would be in place whether or not SCITS continues as a secondary school or is repurposed for some other use.
April 26, 2016	Regular Board Meeting	Keith Wyville spoke about the proposed Sarnia Collegiate Institute and Technical School closure and amalgamation with St. Clair Secondary School. Keith Wyville stated that the electrical bills at SCITS are proportionate to the larger school and reflect its unique facilities. He suggested that the costs discussed in the architect's report require a closer and more critical examination.

**Addendum to the Final Staff Report on the Consolidation of St. Clair Secondary School (SCSS) Report B-16-52 and Sarnia Collegiate Institute & Technical School (SCITS) and The Revision of the City of Sarnia Secondary School Boundaries**

Date	Sarnia South Secondary Accommodation Review Public Delegations	Synopsis
April 26, 2016	Regular Board Meeting	Gavin Hall spoke about the proposed Sarnia Collegiate Institute and Technical School/St. Clair Secondary School amalgamation. Gavin Hall proposed that the Board continue with their plan to move the SCSS students to SCITS for next year. Administration could then determine what upgrades are needed at SCSS and the actual costs. In this way they would be able to show the savings the Board would actually have over the costs of keeping SCITS open and doing the necessary repairs. He commented that the Board is rushing the agenda. Time is needed to see if it is really more expensive at SCITS.
April 26, 2016	Regular Board Meeting	Brad Cullis spoke about the proposed closure of Sarnia Collegiate Institute and Technical School from a planning perspective and as a resident who wants only what is best for the City. He argued that the savings that might be realized by closing SCITS would be trivial to the ensuing socioeconomic and cultural fallout the tax payer would be left with.
April 26, 2016	Regular Board Meeting	Tim Knapp spoke on behalf of the St. Clair Secondary School Council regarding consolidation of Sarnia Collegiate Institute and Technical School and St. Clair Secondary School. He noted the difficult task of balancing the needs of over 22,000 students across 65 schools. He advised that he supported the consolidation of SCITS and SCSS. The combined school will offer greater educational opportunities to all students while allowing the Board to reduce operating costs. He advised that the SCSS School Council is excited for the future of the new combined school and the opportunities that it will provide to the students. He stated that the amalgamation needs to take place quickly to improve the quality of education for the students involved. In the best interest of the students, he urged the Board to move quickly with naming the new school to allow the students to gel as a new student body in the fall.
April 26, 2016	Special Board Meeting	Susan Mackenzie spoke about Sarnia Collegiate Institute and Technical School and made suggestions as to why SCITS is a cost effective building with a minimum of uncertainty to consolidate students to. She has questioned the data and/or timeline provided by staff to the Board and the contractors' reports on the architectural assessment, the asbestos assessment and the Ministry representative's report on the FCI calculations.
April 26, 2016	Special Board Meeting	Sharon Nicol was unable to attend so Susan Mackenzie read her letter to Trustees which spoke to the heritage aspects of SCITS and encouraged Trustees to decide wisely.
April 26, 2016	Special Board Meeting	Chris Burley agreed that it is likely that south Sarnia can only support one public high school. He spoke to SCITS being the better building to house the consolidated students. He spoke to the amenities of the school and the location. He questioned the data provided by Administration.
April 26, 2016	Special Board Meeting	Jennifer George commented that no one can dispute that fact that SCSS and SCITS must be consolidated to provide more equitable access to programs. She commented on the risk of not obtaining full grant approval and the impact on student program. She commented on the loss of scholarships if SCITS is closed and the total monetary value of scholarships provided to SCITS students.
April 26, 2016	Special Board Meeting	Kara Woolridge commented that it cannot be denied that the populations of SCITS and SCSS would benefit from the amalgamation of their student populations. She noted that this could be done at either site. She referred to the benefits of the physical learning environment of SCITS and the community use of the school. She suggested that alternative options could have been explored further. She explained that

**Addendum to the Final Staff Report on the Consolidation of St. Clair Secondary School (SCSS) Report B-16-52 and Sarnia Collegiate Institute & Technical School (SCITS) and The Revision of the City of Sarnia Secondary School Boundaries**

Date	Sarnia South Secondary Accommodation Review Public Delegations	Synopsis
		an online petition has been organized and that to date, over 1,000 signatures and comments have been entered.
April 26, 2016	Special Board Meeting	Kevin Forbes talked to the accommodation review process in general and the credibility of the process. He commented on the higher electrical costs at SCITS which he feels are caused by the HVAC, the pool and auditorium. He questioned the process and data provided by Administration.
April 26, 2016	Special Board Meeting	Mary Ethier suggested that there would be savings if the Board were to close SCSS instead of SCITS. She commented on the items that SCSS does not have and the associated hydro costs. She questioned the engineer's report on the crack in the pool at SCITS. Student Ellis Ethier commented on his concerns about the closure of the SCITS pool and availability of time at the YMCA pool for use by the students at the consolidated school.
April 26, 2016	Special Board Meeting	Scott Sills advised that alternative suggestions were submitted for consideration to keep SCITS open. He called into question the data presented by the Administration and the third parties brought in to clarify the data for the ARC Members and members of the public.

### **Administration's Final Rationale for the Recommendations**

Throughout the Pupil Accommodation Review process, the majority of ARC and community members recognize the advantages of consolidating SCITS and SCSS; however, there has been disagreement over the most appropriate site for the consolidation.

Senior Administration has followed both the Ministry of Education Pupil Accommodation Review Guideline and LKDSB Regulation No: R-AD-106. Administration has been objective in its analysis of both schools and remains confident in its original recommendations for the following reasons:

#### **1. Program Opportunities for Students**

Due to enrolment decline, both SCITS and SCSS have experienced a significant reduction in the number of program options available to students. As well, both schools have experienced a decline in the co-curricular opportunities afforded to their students due to a combination of factors; reductions in staff who have specific qualifications, interest and experiences as well as a reduction in the number of students which make it increasingly difficult to run multiple teams/clubs during the same season. Both principals have reported that the declining ability to provide a breadth of programs and services for students appears to be resulting in some of their potential or current students choosing to attend other schools within the city so that they may receive courses/co-curricular opportunities not available at their "home school". While some students attend both SCITS and SCSS to participate in programs not offered elsewhere in the City of Sarnia, the number of students leaving SCSS and SCITS catchment areas exceeds the number of students attending SCITS and SCSS from outside their catchment area.

Fewer students mean fewer teachers and fewer class sections available for students. A consolidated SCITS/SCSS school will provide:

- Increased opportunities for multiple sections of the same course allowing for more flexibility for student timetables in the school.
- Lower percentage of student scheduling conflicts.
- An increased breadth of senior courses resulting in a greater likelihood that specialized courses can be offered every year and in each semester.
- Larger student populations which generate more staff provides more expertise and diversity in terms of qualifications and experience. This in turn provides increased course options and co-curricular opportunities.
- An increased number of opportunities to offer more Specialized Program pathways for students. Examples include Specialist High Skills Majors (SHSM) including Arts and Culture, Construction, Horticulture and Landscaping, and Transportation.

#### **2. Heritage Designation**

The Sarnia Heritage Committee (SHC), in its position paper, states that it is *looking for a clear and unequivocal commitment from the LKDSB towards the heritage value and conservation of SCITS ....*

The SHC has requested an additional tour to further assess the SCITS building to determine what specific features in the building to recommend for designation. The Sarnia Heritage Committee will present their recommendations to Sarnia City Council. City Council will have the final decision regarding the designation. The City of Sarnia Council has the authority under Section 29 of the Ontario Heritage Act to designate a property without the consent of the property owner. Any alteration likely to result in the loss, damage, alteration or removal of one or more designated heritage attributes requires not only a building permit but approval from the City of Sarnia Heritage Advisory Committee before the work can begin. Greater Essex County District School Board Senior Administration reports that they experienced significant costs and time delays when renovating their heritage designated school site.

The SHC representatives acknowledged that the SCITS building would maintain its designated heritage status if it is sold, consolidated or repurposed.

**3. Community**

At each of our 13 secondary schools, many students typically purchase lunches and snacks at local businesses through the week. While this contributes positively to those businesses that sell those products, student purchases typically are not significant enough to support an entire downtown core of a midsized city. It is the prime responsibility of the LKDSB to provide programs for all of our students. The LKDSB and its schools are committed to maintaining positive working relationships with each of their communities. The LKDSB Sarnia Board Office is located in the Mitton Street commercial area of the City of Sarnia. If SCITS is to be closed, it is Administration’s hope that the building can be repurposed successfully.

**4. Data**

SCITS was built in 1922 and SCSS was built in 1961. Data supports that a 94 year old building will cost more to maintain than a 55 year old building. Data provided by a number of LKDSB and Ministry consultants/experts supports this fact. During the accommodation review process and at the request of the ARC members, Administration arranged for the following consultants to complete a specific SCITS/SCSS comparison.

The following table totals the capital costs for each school as referenced in the Final Staff Report.

Capital Cost Category	Source	SCITS	SCSS
Ministry of Education Long Term Capital Costs (part of FCI Calculations)	Accruent Acquires, VFA, Inc. Capital Database	\$15,165,980	\$13,046,478
Asbestos Assessment Costs	EXP Services Inc. Golder Associates Ltd	5,828,746	790,094
Accessibility and Building Code Costs	JP Thomson Architects Ltd.	13,740,000	3,180,000
Structural Analysis Costs	Robert E. Dale Limited, Consulting Engineers	1,287,000	15,000
<b>TOTAL:</b>		<b>\$36,021,726</b>	<b>\$17,031,572</b>

When assessing both schools from a capital cost stand point SCITS capital costs are \$18,990,154 greater than the comparative capital costs at SCSS.

The following table totals the operating costs for each school as referenced in the Final Staff Report.

Three year Average Annual Operating Costs	Final Staff Report, April 12, 2016	\$1,168,297	\$981,463
---	------------------------------------	-------------	-----------

When assessing both schools from an operating cost stand point SCITS operational costs are \$186,834 greater than the comparative operating costs at SCSS.

**5. Public Confidence**

One of the prevailing themes that has emerged from both the public and ARC working meetings is the allegation that factual data provided by Administration is either inaccurate or has been manipulated to suit Administration’s recommendations. While administration acknowledges that there will be a number of people who will disagree with recommendations, it is important that there is confidence in the data used to drive decisions. To that end Director Costello has confirmed with each of the consultants involved with this accommodation review that their data is accurate and that we are making the recommendation to close the school that is most expensive to maintain over the long term. The consultants: Sazan Bimo, Senior Project Manager, Accruent, VFA, Inc.-Asset Replacement Value (ARV) and FCI Calculation, Mark Beaulieu, Architect, JP Thomson Architects Ltd., Geoff Dale, Principal-Robert E. Dale Limited, Consulting Engineers, Keith Hill, Project Manager, Senior

Environmental Technologist, EXP Services Inc., Christopher Rahm, Associate, Senior EHS Consultant, Golder Associates Ltd., who were named in the Final Staff Report, have individually confirmed that their data is accurate and that SCITS is the costlier building to maintain over the long term.

#### **6. Transition Plan**

If Board approves the consolidation of the Secondary Schools, a Transition Committee will be formed as soon as possible to address the transition of students and staff. Transition Committee membership will consist of:

- Superintendent(s) of Education or designate(s)
- CUPE and OSSTF President/Vice President
- Principals from SCITS and SCSS
- two teachers from SCITS and SCSS
- two students from SCITS and SCSS
- School Council Chairs from SCITS and SCSS
- clerical/custodial staff from SCITS and SCSS
- parent/community members from SCITS and SCSS
- educational assistants from SCITS and SCSS
- First Nation Partner

Subcommittees are developed as needed and may have members who are not on the Transition Committee. The Transition Committee would be responsible for such things as school orientation/transition, memorabilia, resources and equipment, special events (including graduation and awards), extra-curricular activities, mascot and logo.

#### **7. Naming Committee For the Consolidated School**

The practice of the Board has been to establish a Naming Committee when schools are consolidated. In accordance with Board Regulations R-AD-105, when schools are consolidated into one school, the process of naming and/or renaming of Board facilities will be followed. This requires the Director of Education to establish an ad hoc committee to recommend a name to the Board.

The Committee is to be comprised of:

- (a) two trustees, appointed by the Board (one to chair the committee),
- (b) one facility administrator (principal or principal designate if applicable) appointed by the Director,
- (c) two representatives of the School Advisory Councils (if applicable) appointed by the Director,
- (d) two community representatives appointed by the Director,
- (e) one member of the senior administration appointed by the Director.

The Director will communicate to Principals and School Council Chairs information regarding the selection process for Naming Committee Members as soon as possible. The LKDSB website will also be used to facilitate community representation.

Administration is recommending that the Naming Committee be established as of June 1, 2016. As per Board By-laws, Ad Hoc committees exist for a period of three months. Administration is recommending that the three month term for the Naming Committee exclude July and August.

Administration is recommending that the Naming Committee meet before June 30, 2016 in order to establish criteria for the new consolidated school name and a process to gather input from appropriate stakeholders. The Committee will be asked to report back to Board at the August 30, 2016 Board Meeting with this information. The Naming Committee will be asked to submit a final report containing a recommended name for the consolidate school to the Board for approval at the end of October 2016.

Senior Administration has great respect for both SCITS and SCSS communities. Both schools have a rich legacy of success across the arts, academics and athletics. It is the hope of administration that the consolidated school will forge a new future in an improved building while celebrating the legacy of both schools.

**Recommendation #1**

“That the Board approve the consolidation of St. Clair Secondary School (SCSS) and Sarnia Collegiate Institute and Technical School (SCITS) temporarily at the SCITS site effective September 2016 and permanently at the SCSS site effective September 2017 and close the SCITS site as of July 1, 2017.”

**Recommendation #2**

“That the Board approve the revised boundaries for the consolidated St. Clair Secondary School (SCSS) and Sarnia and Collegiate Institute & Technical School (SCITS) School and the Northern Collegiate Institute & Vocational School (NCIVS) effective July 1, 2016 for implementation September 2016.”

**Recommendation #3**

“That the Board approve “grandfathering” with transportation from September 2016 to June 2020, for students currently in Grades 8 to 12 affected by the boundary changes as outlined in the Proposed Boundary Package, effective July 1, 2016 for implementation in September 2016. No special conditions will be applied for siblings to attend the same school.”

**Recommendation #4**

“That the Board dissolve the Sarnia South Secondary Schools Accommodation Review Committee.”

**Recommendation #5**

“That the Board approve the establishment of an Ad Hoc Naming Committee effective June 1, 2016 to October 31, 2016 to recommend to the Board a name for the consolidated St. Clair Secondary School and Sarnia Collegiate Institute & Technical School and provide a progress report to the Board at the August 30, 2016 Regular Board Meeting. The Board will appointment of two Trustees to serve on the Naming Committee.”